

## Historic District Review Committee

### Staff Report

May 11, 2009

#### Action Items

**CAPP 2009-0005 Brown: Replace Front Porch and Enclose Rear Porch on Auxiliary Dwelling in the Goose Creek Historic District. MCPI 423-46-5298.**

#### Background

The building in this application is an auxiliary dwelling on Oakland Green Farm, a 200-acre farm located in the Goose Creek Historic and Cultural Conservation District. Constructed in the early 2000s and approved under CAPP 2000-0005, the auxiliary dwelling is located at 19132 Oakland Green Road. It stands approximately 1/3 of a mile northwest of the main, historic farmhouse on the location of a tenant house that burned down in the 1980s. It is accessed by a gravel driveway and is not visible from Oakland Green Road.

The auxiliary dwelling is a 1½-story frame building clad with board and batten. The house rests on a concrete foundation formed to resemble brick. A chimney on the east end of the house is built of stone harvested from the property and brick.

The applicant proposes two changes to the dwelling: replacing front porch elements and enclosing the screened rear porch. The front porch is in need of repair due to rotting wooden elements. The wood stairs and railing will be replaced in-kind with pressure treated wood. The stairs are painted gray to match the porch and include stringers with treads but no risers. The balustrade is comprised of square balusters with a board top rail. It is painted white. The new balustrade and stairs will not be painted, but will be sealed six months after installation. In addition, new square wood lattice is proposed for the area beneath the front porch. It will be painted gray, the same color as the house.

The rear porch will be enclosed to add a half bath to the dwelling. The exterior will be clad with rough sawn board-and-batten matching the existing house. The drawings show that the frieze board above the porch in the side elevation will be removed. Anderson clad double-hung windows of the same type installed in the house will be used. The fenestration in the enclosure will change from one double door to a single door and two windows similar to the fenestration beneath the front porch. A paired double hung window will be installed in the side elevation. A stone pier beneath the porch corner will be retained. The applicant is unsure whether the formed concrete foundation will extend beneath the porch or the board-and-batten will extend to the ground, although she prefers the former.

Based on correspondence from the Zoning Division of the Loudoun County Department of Building and Development dated April 24, 2009, there are no zoning issues with the application.

### **Analysis**

The Loudoun County Historic District Guidelines: Goose Creek (Goose Creek Guidelines) will be used to evaluate this application.

#### *Front Porch Replacement*

The rotting wood porch elements, including the stringers, treads, and balustrade, will be replaced in-kind with pressure-treated wood. Since the elements will match the shape and dimensions of the existing elements and will be wood, these repairs are in accordance with Goose Creek Guidelines. The Guidelines state that damaged elements should be replaced matching the materials, methods of construction, and details of the original (Goose Creek Guidelines, Guidelines for Existing Structures: Elements – Porticos, Front and Rear Porches, Guideline J.1., p. 112). However, staff recommends that the replaced stairs and balustrade be primed and painted to match details of the existing porch elements.

The installation of painted square wood lattice to screen the area beneath the porch is an acceptable porch treatment. The Goose Creek Guidelines provide several examples of wood lattice with a square pattern, identifying it as a historically appropriate method of screening; therefore, it is a compatible porch treatment (Goose Creek Guidelines, Guidelines for Existing Structures: Elements – Foundations, Photo Caption, p. 114, also Photos on pgs. 74 and 113).

#### *Rear Porch Enclosure*

The Goose Creek Guidelines state that porch enclosures in secondary elevations that radically change the historic appearance should be avoided (Goose Creek Guidelines, Guidelines for Existing Structures: Elements – Porticos, Front and Rear Porches, Inappropriate Treatment J.4., p. 112). The auxiliary dwelling is not historic. Nonetheless, the enclosure of the rear porch, which is located in a secondary elevation, will not drastically change the building's appearance. This is because the porch to be enclosed is beneath the main roofline of the house. In addition, materials used for the enclosure will match the house, including rough sawn board-and-batten and Anderson clad double hung windows. The stone pier will also be retained. Furthermore, the fenestration on the rear of the house will be similar to the front of the house. These elements will allow the proposed enclosure to blend into the main block, meeting the guidelines for porch enclosures and for materials and details for additions (Goose Creek Guidelines, Guidelines for Additions: Materials and Details, Guideline E.1., p. 86). Staff also notes that this alteration will not be visible from the road.

The guidelines for new construction state that the foundation should be distinguished from the rest of the building by using different materials. The auxiliary dwelling has an elevated foundation, which is differentiated from the building above and is typical of buildings in the Goose Creek Historic District. Extending the board-and-batten siding to

the ground, one proposal provided by the applicant for the foundation construction, would not meet the Goose Creek Guidelines. (Goose Creek Guidelines, Guidelines for New Construction: Foundations, Guideline P.2., p. 76). Staff recommends that a matching formed concrete foundation (also proposed and preferred by the applicant) or a different material be used beneath the enclosed porch to maintain the demarcation between the foundation and the building.

## Findings

1. The auxiliary dwelling, constructed in the early 2000s, is not historic and not visible from Oakland Green Road.
2. Replacing the damaged front porch details with elements similar in material, design, and construction is consistent with the Loudoun County Historic District Guidelines: Goose Creek Historic District.
3. Leaving the porch balustrade and stairs unpainted is not consistent with the original porch details and does not meet the Goose Creek Guidelines.
4. Screening the area beneath the porch with square wooden lattice is a compatible treatment in the Goose Creek Historic District.
5. Enclosing a porch located in a secondary elevation and beneath the main roof of the house will not drastically change the building's appearance.
6. Enclosing the rear porch with siding and windows matching the existing building and fenestration meets the Goose Creek Guidelines.
7. The foundation should be differentiated from the rest of the building to meet the Goose Creek Guidelines.

## Recommendation

Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:

1. The replaced balustrade be primed and painted to match the existing details.
2. The foundation under the enclosed rear porch be differentiated from the rest of the building by a formed concrete foundation matching the existing or a different material appropriate for foundations in the Goose Creek Historic District.

## Suggested Motions

1. *I move that the Historic District Review Committee approve Certificate of Appropriateness 2009-0005 for the proposed rear porch enclosure and front porch details replacement at 19132 Oakland Green Road in accordance with the Loudoun County Historic District Guidelines for the Goose Creek Historic and Cultural Conservation District based on the following findings...(see findings above).*
2. *I move that the Historic District Review Committee approve Certificate of Appropriateness 2009-0005 for the proposed rear porch enclosure and front porch details replacement at 19132 Oakland Green Road in accordance with the*

Loudoun County Historic District Guidelines for the Goose Creek Historic and Cultural Conservation District based on the following findings...(see findings above)...and with the following conditions...(see conditions above).

3. I move alternate motion...